Bar & Bench (www.barandbench.com)

SUPREME COURT OF INDIA

This file relates to the proposal for appointment of following 19 Additional Judges of the Allahabad High Court, as Permanent Judges of that High Court:

1 Mr. Justice Rajiv Joshi
2 Mr. Justice Rahul Chaturvedi
3 Mr. Justice Salil Kumar Rai
4 Mr. Justice Jayant Banerji
5 Mr. Justice Rajesh Singh Chauhan
6 Mr. Justice Irshad Ali
7 Mr. Justice Saral Srivastava
8 Mr. Justice Jahangir Jamshed Munir
9 Mr. Justice Rajiv Gupta
10 Mr. Justice Siddharth
11 Mr. Justice Ajit Kumar
12 Mr. Justice Rajnish Kumar
13 Mr. Justice Abdul Moin
14 Mr. Justice Dinesh Kumar Singh
15 Mr. Justice Rajeev Misra
16 Mr. Justice Vivek Kumar Singh
17 Mr. Justice Chandra Dhari Singh
18 Mr. Justice Ajay Bhanot
19 Mr. Justice Neeraj Tiwari

The Collegium of the Allahabad High Court vide Minutes dated 18th February, 2019 has unanimously recommended the above-named Additional Judges for appointment as Permanent Judges of that High Court.

We have perused and duly taken note of the views of the Chief Minister and the Governor for the State of Uttar Pradesh placed in the file.

In order to ascertain suitability of the above-named recommendees for being appointed as Permanent Judges, we have consulted our colleagues who are conversant with the affairs of the Allahabad High Court. We have duly taken note of the opinion expressed by each of

Bar & Bench (www.barandbench.com)

them. Copies of letters of opinion of our consultee-colleagues are placed below.

The Committee constituted in terms of the Resolution dated 26th October, 2017 of the Supreme Court Collegium to evaluate the judgments of the above-named recommendees, has submitted its report. A copy of the said report dated 22nd March, 2019 is placed below.

Certain unconfirmed inputs touching upon conduct / behaviour of some of the recommendees have been placed on record. In our view, the same deserve to be ignored as we do not find any substance therein.

With a view to assess merit and suitability of the above-named recommendees for appointment as Permanent Judges, we have carefully scrutinized the material placed on record including certain complaints received against some of the above-named recommendees. On overall assessment based on views of our consultee-colleagues, the report of the Judgment Evaluation Committee, views of the State Government, observations made by the Department of Justice in the file and having regard to all relevant factors, the Collegium is of the view that Mr. Justices (1) Rajiv Joshi, (2) Salil Kumar Rai, (3) Jayant Banerji, (4) Rajesh Singh Chauhan, (5) Saral Srivastava, (6) Jahangir Jamshed Munir, (7) Rajiv Gupta, (8) Siddharth, (9) Ajit Kumar, (10) Rajnish Kumar, (11) Abdul Moin, (12) Dinesh Kumar Singh, (13) Rajeev Misra, (14) Vivek Kumar Singh, (15) Chandra Dhari Singh, and (16) Ajay Bhanot, Additional Judges, are suitable for being appointed as Permanent Judges.

As regards Mr. Justices (1) Rahul Chaturvedi, (2) Irshad Ali and (3) Neeraj Tiwari (mentioned at Sl.Nos. 2, 6 and 19 above), the Collegium is of the considered view that consideration of their proposal deserves to be deferred. The Collegium resolves to recommend accordingly. The proposals would be taken up for consideration on receipt of certain additional information from the Chief Justice of the Allahabad High Court.

Bar & Bench (www.barandbench.com)

In view of the above, the Collegium resolves to recommend that Mr. Justices (1) Rajiv Joshi, (2) Salil Kumar Rai, (3) Jayant Banerji, (4) Rajesh Singh Chauhan, (5) Saral Srivastava, (6) Jahangir Jamshed Munir, (7) Rajiv Gupta, (8) Siddharth, (9) Ajit Kumar, (10) Rajnish Kumar, (11) Abdul Moin, (12) Dinesh Kumar Singh, (13) Rajeev Misra, (14) Vivek Kumar Singh, (15) Chandra Dhari Singh, and (16) Ajay Bhanot, Additional Judges be appointed as Permanent Judges of the Allahabad High Court against the existing vacancies.

(Ranjan Gogoi), C.J.I.

(S.A.Bobde), J.

(N.V. Ramana), J.

July 30, 2019.

Bar & Bench (www.barandbench.com)

SUPREME COURT OF INDIA

This file relates to the proposal for appointment of Mr. Justice Virendra Kumar-II, Additional Judge of the Allahabad High Court, as Permanent Judge.

The above recommendation unanimously made by the Collegium of the Allahabad High Court vide Minutes dated 8th April, 2019 has the concurrence of the Chief Minister and the Governor of the State of Uttar Pradesh.

In order to ascertain suitability of Mr. Justice Virendra Kumar-II for being appointed as Permanent Judge, we have consulted our colleagues who are conversant with the affairs of the Allahabad High Court. We have duly taken note of the opinion expressed by each of them. Copies of letters of opinion of our consultee-colleagues are placed below.

Having regard to the material on record, the Collegium is of the considered view that consideration of his proposal deserves to be deferred. The Collegium resolves to recommend accordingly. The proposal would be taken up for consideration on receipt of certain additional information from the Chief Justice of the Allahabad High Court.

(Ranjan Gogoi), C.J.I.

(S.A. Bobde), J.

(N.V. Ramana), J.

July 30, 2019.